

## “SO MANY FEELS~!”

### *Queering Male Shonen Characters in BL Anime Music Videos and Dōjinshi Music Videos*

**Julie Brousseau**

For the past three decades, fan productions, and especially remix creations produced by women for women have gotten more academic interest. For instance, many scholars have focused on vidding and the communities of women built around the practice of remixing videos (Coppa 2008, 2011, 2018; Turk 2012; Freund 2011, 2013), looking particularly at storytelling and queer readings of character relationships. Other scholars turned their attention towards animation and the gender representations present in the wider practice of Anime Music Videos (AMV). Yet, limited attention has been given to the technical aspect of women’s fan made videos, particularly in regards to AMVs. Indeed, Samantha Close (2014) studied both the reinforcement and the critique of hegemonic masculinity in AMVs, and Elizabeth Birmingham (2013) specifically narrowed her research to a type of video most often produced by young women: homoerotic Boy’s Love (BL) AMVs. While their contributions are definitely enlightening, Close’s and Birmingham’s analyses remain limited to the use of specific narrative themes and of character appearances by AMV editors to either reinforce or blur the delimitations of the typical gender binary. Therefore, in this paper, I will not only look at BL AMVs’ narratives, but also at the medium itself; to see how AMV creators’ specific techniques of remediation produce representations of gender. To do so, I will expand on Japanese scholar Naoko Mori’s work on manga and *dōjinshi* (fanzines). Mori explores how gender is expressed through corporeal motion (2010, 2012), arguing that BL *dōjinshi* combines the physical action of boy’s manga and the emotional stillness of girl’s manga, and is therefore able to blur traditional gender identities. However, Mori only applies her argument to narratives and illustrations drawn on paper. Thus, I will extend her framework to AMVs. Through a formal analysis of several *One Piece* ZoSan BL “ship”<sup>2</sup> videos made by women editors<sup>3</sup> and published on YouTube, I will show how the remixed medium is able to offer an alternative to Western<sup>4</sup> hegemonic, heterosexual models of masculinity.

#### **Origins: Slash, Boys’ Love and Yaoi**

Although AMVs originally appeared within the broader Western anime fandom (Roberts 2012), BL “ship” videos also draw from two other branches of fan productions: Western slash fiction and Japanese *shōnen ai* and *yaoi* manga. Considered “variant threads of the same genre” (Isola 2008, 86), they share a special characteristic: slash and BL are both traditionally made by women, for women.

Slash fiction originated in the United States during the 1970s when writers queered *Star Trek: The Original Series*’s Captain Kirk and Mr. Spock’s relationship, transforming their homosocial bond into an explicitly homosexual one. That practice then extended to other television shows in the following years, in-

cluding *Starsky and Hutch* (1975-1979), *Blake's 7* (1978-1981), and *The Professionals* (1977-1983) (Jenkins 2013, 203). Although slash started as a literary genre, it also eventually extended to the vidding community (Jenkins 2013, 225–226; Coppa 2008, 3).

Originating on the other side of the world, *shōnen ai*, or its contemporary alternative term BL, is a branch of Japanese manga and anime that, as its name suggests, also focuses on romantic relationships between male characters. Graphic sexual imagery, or “Hardcore BL,” originated as *yaoi*<sup>5</sup> fanzines, short for “*yamanashi, ochinashi, iminashi* or ‘no climax, no point, no meaning’” (McHarry 2009, 185). In Japan this genre started as manga in the 1970s, with the *nijūyū nen gumi*.<sup>6</sup> Composed of several female *mangaka*<sup>7</sup> born around the 24<sup>th</sup> year of Japan’s Showa period (1949), the *nijūyū nen gumi* usually created narratives taking place in foreign countries. The stories were often set in boarding schools where male students could explore their sexuality along with their young peers, or with adult staff members (Ishida 2008; Bollman 2010, 44).

During the 1980s, amateur artists began creating *dōjinshi* between already existing heterosexual male protagonists, bringing the aesthetics of *yaoi* to the narratives and characters of *shōnen* (boy’s) action manga.<sup>8</sup> Mori observes that *shōnen* manga relies on motions, and most particularly on *bodies* in motion. These comics focus on a character’s exteriority through the use of fast pace action, for instance. In contrast, *shōjo* (girl’s) manga relies on stillness and emotions, which directs attention towards the characters’ interiority. Thus, there are often extensive uses of speech bubbles in *shōjo* narratives to express inner monologues, as well as fewer movements within the individual frames, a phenomenon Minori Ishida (2008, 29) called an “overflow of interiority.” According to Mori, the sum of these strategies results in *yaoi dōjinshi*: originally inspired by *shōnen* manga but written by and for girls as is *shōjo*. *Yaoi dōjinshi* allows the insertion of the stillness associated with sexuality and emotions into more action-oriented narratives.<sup>9</sup>

It was not until the early 2000s that Japanese BL manga and *yaoi* reached a Western audience. TOKYO-POP acquired the rights to translate and distribute some of the original manga and *dōjinshi* in the United States, expanding the audience (Bollman 2010, 44). Since then, online BL fan communities have enabled the growth of this genre internationally. Non-Japanese-speaking fans can now read and/or watch original series and BL publications that have not yet been officially distributed in their home countries through unofficial fan translations available online (Wood 2006, 304). Through these channels, it is also now much easier for fans to access original material used for subsequent remediation in AMVs.

### The Bishonen’s Androgyny and Female Fans

Queer male characters in *yaoi* manga, anime, and AMVs open up a space for female fans to fantasize from the male subject position. Many of the male protagonists in BL media are androgynous *bishōnen*,<sup>10</sup> whose fluid gender results in complicated relations of identification and desire. They (Figure 1) are “visually and psychically neither male nor female” (Welker 2006, 842). They “are highly feminized... typically slender, long-haired, big-eyed, pretty” to the point that “viewers not familiar with anime often misidentify them as girls”



**Figure 1.** Gilbert from *Kaze No Ki No Uta* (Keiko Takemiya, 1987), an example of a bishōnen character.

(Birmingham 2013, 161). In an attempt to problematize women's attraction to BL, Chizuko Ueno pointed to how *bishōnen* allow women readers and viewers to both identify with and romantically fantasize about these so-called "genderless" characters (Ueno 1998). Although Masami Toku argues that BL protagonists are "symbols of girls' wishes to be independent and pure, and not objects with which to fall in love" (2007, 27), Elizabeth Birmingham asserts that through fantasies, girls "are able to recapture and control the objectifying gaze that is usually a male prerogative and pleasure, and turn it back on to the male body" (2013, 162). The female viewers could thus have access to a position of power through the gaze, but also through identification with the characters by experiencing what Uli Meyer calls "creative transvestism":

the fans/artists...[can take] a traditionally male sexual position, which allows them to experience themselves, among other things, as penetrator (*seme*) and a male counterpart (*uke*) as penetrated. Thus, the transgression of sexuality and gender in BL can be quite literal, enabling its readers/creators to identify or feel with the male characters on a physical level. (2013, 233)

Therefore, as Edo Ernesto dit Alban explains in this issue, the beautiful boys of *shōnen ai* were born as a queer expression avoiding the canon of boy's manga focusing on corporeal motion to develop characters. They are created physically softer to give way to more emotional depth and freedom in the first place.

Yet, what about AMVs that remediate *shōnen* series starring traditionally masculine protagonists? Birmingham suggests that in these cases, "some girl fans...wish to revise and reframe [*shōnen*] anime to reflect relationships in which partners have adventurous and active lives, punctuated by lots of making out, even if it is occasionally surprised, coerced or confused making out" (2013, 157). The androgyny then applies to the characters' emotional state rather than their physical appearance. As Henry Jenkins explains about slash:

Androgyny... [in slash] does not mean a "loss of masculinity" so much as it means the opening of new possibilities within the homosocial continuum, a broadening of the range of different styles of human interactions available to these characters. Slash does not imply that homosexual desire is any less "masculine" than repressed homosocial desire, though it does call into question any rigid boundary between masculinity and femininity. (2013, 218)

Therefore, slash and BL act as fantasy genres with unlimited possibilities rather than narratives conveying realistic depictions of homosexual relationships. They blur the lines that traditionally define genders and sexual orientations in a patriarchal society (McHarry 2009, 189).

Although male protagonists are sometimes confronted with social boundaries in the context of their storyline, there is more often "little or no sense of a homonormative environment established in opposition to a prevailing heteronormative one, little or no need for same-sex desiring male to form an identity or, in support of it, to allow or prohibit conduct and viewpoint" (McHarry 2009, 191). Instead, BL's main protagonists are "narrative outlaw[s] inviting...seducing, readers to violate patriarchal law with regard to love, gender, sex, and sexuality," starring in works that "offer narrative safe havens where [the artists and readers] can experiment with identity" (Welker 2006, 865–886). Henry Jenkins (2006) uses the metaphor from *Star Trek II: The Wrath of Khan* (1982) to describe the slash phenomenon: the glass separating Kirk and Spock in Spock's famous death scene, when Spock sacrifices his life to save the U.S.S Enterprise (Figure 2). Jenkins'



**Figure 2.**  
Captain Kirk and Mr. Spock separated by a wall of glass in *Star Trek II: The Wrath of Khan* (1982)

point demonstrates how slash (and by extension BL AMVs) can further deconstruct assumed gender roles and attitudes:

Spock is dying and Kirk stands there, a wall of glass separating the two longtime buddies. Both of them are reaching out towards each other, their hands pressed hard against the glass, trying to establish physical contact...Spock calls Kirk his friend, the fullest expression of their feelings anywhere in the series. Almost everyone who watches the scene feels the passion the two men share, the hunger for something more than what they are allowed. (2006, 72)

Jenkins identifies the glass that separates the two characters as an “aspect of traditional masculinity which prevent[s] emotional expressiveness or physical intimacy between men” (2006, 72). He argues that slash removes the glass barrier, which then allows the male protagonists to truly share an emotional bond without submitting themselves to society’s limitations. The genre “makes masculinity the central problem within its narrative development and tries to envision a world where conventional sexual identities are re-defined in a more fluid, less hierarchical fashion” and serves “to establish a homosocial-homoerotic continuum as an alternative to repressive and hierarchical male sexuality” (Jenkins 2013, 219). BL AMVs starring *shōnen* characters achieve the same effect: they teach us “how to recognize the signs of emotional caring beneath all the masks by which traditional male culture seeks to repress or hide those feelings” (Jenkins 2006, 72). However, as I will demonstrate, it is not solely through the narrative, but also through the form of the medium itself. Techniques specific to *yaoi* manga like inner monologue are used in BL AMVs to develop the emotional side of characters, which queer normative forms of masculinity and question how the moving bodies of anime characters express gender.

### AMV 101: remix and montage

AMVs remix anime clips in synchronization with a chosen song’s rhythm, lyrics, and mood to create a new narrative (Close 2014, 207). Although the purest AMVs usually only remix excerpts from a singular anime series, it is more common for editors nowadays to also include other types of media to fill out missing actions or dialogues, such as fan art or panels from manga and *dōjinshi*. AMVs’ lesser-known cousin, the *Dōjinshi* Music Videos (DMVs), employ a similar structure but borrow most of their visual material from amateur manga, animating cut up characters or whole frames and juxtaposing them and/or rearranging them on black or colourful backgrounds.

While BL fanfiction and *dōjinshi* usually allow the authors to build and deepen the characters’ relationship over a longer period of time, BL “ship” AMVs and DMVs are generally no longer than the length of a song—a few minutes at most. Thus, these often qualify as what Samantha Close calls “source-fandom” creations: “[u]nlike genre or meta-fandom creators, source-fandom makers expect audiences to already be familiar with the sampled footage. In this way, watching source-fandom videos requires both on-the-spot interpretation and memory of originally viewing the clips” (2013, 205). In these cases, viewers unfamiliar with the original material can still understand the general sense from the combination of excerpts and lyrics, but fans perceive an additional layer of nuances and subtleties. This is one reason why, to perform a more thorough analysis of both thematic and aesthetic components, I chose a universe I am very familiar with: Eiichirō Oda’s *One Piece*. Additionally, as the longest running *shōnen* manga series, it possesses an impressively large and loyal international fandom. First published as manga in the magazine *Shōnen Jump* in 1997 and aired as an anime in 1999 in Japan, *One Piece* currently holds the Guinness record for the “most copies published for the same comic book series by a single author,” with an impressive 320,866,000 units already sold in 2015 (Swatman 2015). The series follows the young pirate captain Luffy D. Monkey and his eccentric crew, the Straw Hats,<sup>11</sup> as they explore the fictional universe’s oceans in search of the titular “One Piece” treasure, left behind by the former pirate king.

### Case Study: Zoro + Sanji = ZoSan

Amongst the most popular *One Piece* BL “ships” is the one between the (unofficial) first mate Zoro Ror-



**Figure 3.** Physical altercation between Sanji (left) and Zoro (right) in episode 211, "Round 2! Shoot It Into the Groggy Ring!"



**Figure 4.** Zoro hits Sanji to prevent him from intervening. In Vampiraker's "{ZoSan ▶ All this time}" (2013). 2:32



**Figure 5.** Sanji's hand slides down Zoro's arm, taken from the original episode 377 and used by editor Katerina RORONOA in her video "One Piece—Zoro x Sanji (zosan)" (2011). 2:09

onoa and the chef/cook Sanji (Blackleg) Vinsmoke, shortened to "ZoSan" by fans.<sup>12</sup> They represent two different male tropes often found in *shōnen* narratives: the stoic warrior and the gentleman/pervert. Respectively a swordsman and a martial artist, both are excellent fighters and entertain a somewhat healthy rivalry, which is exteriorized through their corporality, echoing Mori's description of *shōnen* manga's style of expression. Zoro and Sanji's interactions consist of regular physical combat (Figure 3) to prove their superiority, or verbal battles of insults and violent bickering. Both use strategies that, although different, have the same purpose: to perpetuate traditionally masculine behaviors while suppressing genuine emotions, and most particularly those stereotypically aligned with femininity. On the one hand, Zoro normally masks his emotions behind a sober facial expression, with the exception of anger, annoyance and pride. Sanji, on the other hand, shows a wide range of emotions so exaggerated that it becomes difficult to differentiate socially constructed behaviors (what is expected of him) from what he truly feels. Yet, despite their intense rivalry and their restricted range of expressed emotions, Zoro and Sanji also seem to respect each other and demonstrate concern at several points throughout the development of the series. It is thus not surprising that many fans perceive the two pirates' homosocial bond as a deeper, more romantic one; transforming their charged friendship into a homosexual relationship. BL AMVs therefore use the still images usually affiliated with inner monologue in *yaoi* manga to represent the hidden relationship between characters. As such, AMVs alternate between fan art, manga illustrations and scenes from the anime series to introduce queer motion into heteronormative narratives. In homage to Thomas Lamarre's work on Japanese animation, and most particularly his theorization of the animetic interval<sup>13</sup> (Lamarre, 2009), I will use the metaphor of layers to dissect the various techniques of expressions focusing on animating emotions in BL AMVs.

### First Layer: Visual Pieces in Movement

Thematically, this deliberate shift in between still and moving images is demonstrated through the frequent reappearances of specific clips in different



**Figure 6.** Sanji's curly eyebrow and Zoro's determined face in Sherlock Elric's "Savin Me With—Zoro x Sanji / zosan {AMV}" (2019). 0:32



**Figure 7.** The image on left zooms out to reveal a smirking Sanji in Sherlock Elric's "Savin Me With—Zoro x Sanji / zosan {AMV}" (2019) 0:32



**Figure 8.** Katerina RORONOA's "One Piece—Zoro x Sanji (zosan)" (2011) 2:09

"ZoSan" AMVs. In the series, there are many instances where a *nakama* (crewmate/friend)<sup>14</sup> puts themselves in danger to protect or rescue another. For Zoro and Sanji, these moments are read by fans as especially high in suppressed emotions. For example, in the episode "My Crewmate's Pain is My Pain, Zoro Fights Prepared to Die,"<sup>15</sup> the Straw Hats must hand their captain over to the authorities or face death. Zoro offers to take Luffy's place, only to be stopped by a bloody, barely standing Sanji. The swordsman hits the cook with the handle of his katanas to save his life (Figure 4). From that sequence originates the slow touch of Sanji's hand on Zoro's lower arm (Figure 5).

This moment is often reframed in "ZoSan" AMVs as a sign of their romantic affection breaking through simple friendship, so much so that some BL "ship" videos are solely dedicated to its exploration. In Sherlock Elric's "Savin Me With—Zoro x Sanji / zosan {AMV}" (2019), Sanji's panicked discovery of Zoro's bloodied form is followed by a "flashback" shot of the cook kneeling in front of the swordsman, right after the initial hit, making it look like Sanji is clinging to Zoro as a last hope to save him. The point of view is then reversed in the next shot, a shift from motion to stillness that exposes his usually repressed emotions. A still image of Zoro's determined face is in the foreground, and behind him on the left side of the screen, Sanji's swirly eyebrow becomes the centre of attention (Figure 6), before zooming out to reveal his grinning face (Figure 7). This detail is important because the swordsman often refers to the cook as "curly brow" or "dart brow", in allusion to his unique facial feature. In Sherlock Elric's video, the swordsman's obsession with the blond cook's strange eyebrow becomes a sign of his repressed romantic feelings. His insults are represented as deflecting strategies, or "pet names" able to fit within *One Piece's* representations of masculinity.

A similar effect is achieved in Katerina RORONOA's rendition of the scene in their video, "One Piece—Zoro x Sanji (zosan)" (2011). Rather than using a masque, the editor juxtaposes a close-up of one of Zoro's (rare) distressed expression over the disappearing figure of Sanji (Figure 8), also hinting at the swordsman's hidden affection. In addition, part of the emotionally charged dialogue between

the two characters is both heard and seen. As the original Japanese audio plays, a rough English translation fades in and out of the image in a dramatic fashion: “I apologize, but it is similar. You should find other cook [sic].” The combination of the two effects emphasizes the emotional impact, gives more weight to the cook’s gesture and words. Thus, at its simplest, purest form, remediation of original footage into an AMV signifies freeing a normally frozen visual narrative. In this way, we could say that the editing process, by moving around clips and characters to create a new montage, also allows the “revelation” of hidden or repressed emotions.

Manifestations of the characters’ interiority are also present in the lyrics. Some editors prefer adopting a more sober and straightforward aesthetic, as does user Lola Ferreyra in her video, “One Piece Love me like you do ZoSan amv” (2017), where the words materialize in random locations on the screen, always in the same basic font and either in black or white. Others use fonts, colors and positioning which reinforce their video’s mood and contribute to the revelation of emotions, as is the case with AMVmultiE’s “[ZoSan] One more night” (2016). For example, a clear emphasis is put on the word “NO,” as it appears in a larger white font (Figure 9); same as with the “YES” in the following image (Figure 10). However, the positions of the words in the background, slightly faded, in comparison to the smaller, but also darker and bolder sentences in the foreground, also hints at the interior conflict implied in both Maroon 5’s original song and in the *dōjinshi*’s frames. In this way, the AMV is able to go a step further than paper versions of *dōjinshi* to disclose hidden feelings. Instead of speech bubbles, which require stable fonts and styles to be easily read, and are immobile due to the nature of their medium, AMVs’ lyrics can communicate a variety of different feelings both aurally and visually.

### Second layer: Moving *Dōjinshi*

AMVmultiE’s “[ZoSan] One more night” is also a quite refined example of *Dōjinshi* Music Video. Following Mori’s argument, the use of *yaoi dōjinshi* as a primary source of material by DMV editors already lays the foundation for the production of more fluid gender representations, but the remedi-



**Figure 9.** Screenshot of AMVmultiE’s “[ZoSan] One more night” (2016) 2:33



**Figure 10.** Screenshot of AMVmultiE’s “[ZoSan] One more night” (2016) 2:33

ation techniques employed in the videos are also able to multiply the images' effects. Taking advantage of the cinematic quality of manga-style drawings to convey the illusion of movement, the DMVs' footage only requires a few changes to be brought to life. Indeed, because of the visual dynamism of Japanese comics, simple pans and zoom suffice to animate the action. For a moment, an image of bloody Zoro and Sanji, holding each other's shirts in a tensed position, moves in different directions and at different paces across the screen (Figure 11). Although the original *dōjinshi* image is still, the slight shaking reveals the exteriority of the characters' bodies. As opposed to previous examples, where we looked at the character's mind from outside, we now witness the "coming to life" of stillness, the insertion of Zoro and Sanji's active natures into the new narrative. This is even more obvious in the following scene, where the editor animates the characters in a way that makes it seem as if Zoro was actually holding and shaking Sanji, moving his arm in slow movements back and forth. The words appearing in the background in big, bold white and yellow letters mirror the action, as if the two men were screaming at each other (Figure 12).

Their level of intensity only increases as time goes on. In later sequences, the contrast between exteriority and interiority can be seen within the same frame. Panning up from Zoro and Sanji, shown in a passionate embrace, the words "but I'll only stay with you one more night" appear on the right (Figure 13). In the background, entire pages of *dōjinshi* depicting sexual acts between the two men move through the screen at an increasingly fast rhythm. The montage's visual energy is enhanced by the use of a noise effect over the images; as if the two lovers were unable to stay still, ready to burst out of their drawn renditions. With this juxtaposition, we are given a clear look of the characters' states of mind, of the clash between their "true" inner emotions and



**Figure 11.**  
Screenshot of AMVmultiE's "[ZoSan] One more night" (2016) 0:18



**Figure 12.**  
Screenshot of AMVmultiE's "[ZoSan] One more night" (2016) 0:32



**Figure 13.**  
Screenshot of AMVmultiE's "[ZoSan] One more night" (2016) 1:09





**Figure 14.**  
Screenshot of AMVmultiE's "[ZoSan] One more night" (2016) 2:25



**Figure 15.**  
Screenshot of Densetsui's „ZoSan} Beating Heart Baby ♥" (2011) 0:17



**Figure 16.**  
Screenshot of Densetsui's „ZoSan} Beating Heart Baby ♥" (2011) 0:37

their need to maintain appearances, as required by the strict, limited boundaries of the gender binary present in the original manga. Indeed, even if the images in the background have are clearly as sexually explicit as the ones showcased in the foreground, they are also often more violently passionate in nature, putting the emphasis on sex's physicality (e.g.: strong trusting motions, screaming, drooling, manhandling) rather than emotional intimacy. Sex becomes an extension of their usual fights, simply another manifestation of physical prowess, an occasion to gain the upper hand on the other. Eventually, the two layers merge into one in the video's concluding sequence (Figure 14). An image of the two men, a little roughed up but seeming content in their even tighter embrace, slowly pans up in the background, echoing the earlier foreground depiction of the couple. The last lyrics of the song, "yeah baby give me one more night," appear on the screen, finally showcasing the acceptance of their emotions.

The "coming to life" effect of stillness seen in AMVmultiE's video is even more strongly witnessed in user Densetsui's creations. In "ZoSan} Beating Heart Baby ♥" (2011) characters' silhouettes are juxtaposed in ways so as to create an effect of depth. For example, in one scene Sanji is seen drinking directly from a wine bottle in the foreground, back to the viewer, while a slightly paler depiction of Zoro looks at him from the background (Figure 15). Although the borrowed images themselves retain their stillness, the difference in color tones between the two drawings, the bold black contours of Sanji's form as well as their independent motions in the video tricks the viewers' eye into perceiving a spatial gap between the characters. Later on, the editor uses a combination of fades and pans to animate the men's fight: Zoro can be seen "flying" from where he is kicked by Sanji, the pieces of wall opening up and down to let the swordsman continue his movement towards the left end of the screen (Figure 16).

However, it is in Densetsui's video "Afterward' //ZoSan" that the combination of stillness and movement is the strongest, as Densetsui cuts and moves individual sections of the characters' silhouettes to recreate more natural movements: their hair undulates, their eyes open and close, each part of Sanji's leg move independently from the ground to the wall to threaten Zoro, their lips stretch and the

blush lines appear on their cheeks after they share their first kiss (Figure 17 and fig. 18). In an interesting exchange of mediums, it is now the *dōjinshi* excerpts which express motions, while the darkened anime footage coupled with the song's lyrics serve as a manifestation of the pirates' feelings. There are thus now two layers of movements able to reveal hidden feelings; one present in the essence of *dōjinshi* itself, and the other in the combination of *dōjinshi*'s still drawings with audiovisual remediations techniques.

### Third Layer: The Editor's Feelings Seep Through the Cracks

The editors are also able to combine motion and stillness, bodies and emotions, through the portrayal of the characters' (very fit) bodies, a process that is reused by Vampiraker in several of their videos. For example, "#SELFIE" uses a montage of fan art starring Zoro and Sanji in "sexy" poses—"captured" in the process of removing their shirt (or already completely shirtless (Figure 19), embracing or kissing—to refer to the song's lyrics, heard previously: "After we go to the bathroom, can we go smoke a cigarette? / I really need one / But first / Let me take a selfie." In "Monster," the editor pans across same image of Zoro removing his shirt, while footage of Sanji in "love mode" (his eyes transformed into hearts) plays in the background (Figure 20).

Lady Gaga's lyrics "He ate my heart / He a-ate my heart" then communicates Sanji's emotional (but mostly physical) attraction for the swordsman. In both cases, the characters' bodies are fragmented through close-ups of their face, torso or back which, according to Andrea Wood, can provoke fantasies in the viewer: "[t]his tantalizing and suggestive imagery leaves a lot to the reader's [or viewer's] imagination, allowing for many different readings, identifications, and stimuli for fantasies" (2006, 298). Vampiraker also achieves this effect through a fast montage of suggestive fan art, following the song's fast beat in "Love KILLER." Although, in this case, the images are much closer to erotica or soft-core porn than the simple admiration of half-covered male anatomy depicted in the former examples, the viewer either needs to pause "Love KILLER," or rewatch it multiple times to be able to take in all the graphic details, also potentially stimulating



**Figure 17.**  
Zoro's eyes as they start to open in surprise during the kiss in Densetsui's „Afterward“ // ZoSan“ (2017) 0:48



**Figure 18.**  
Zoro's eyes as they start to open in surprise during the kiss in Densetsui's „Afterward“ // ZoSan“ (2017) 0:48



**Figure 19.**  
Zoro removing his shirt in a "sexy" fashion in Vampiraker's "#SELFIE" (2014). 1:01



**Figure 20.**  
Same fan art image of Zoro removing his shirt, used in Vampiraker's "Monster" (2012). 0:27

fantasies. The use of these “moving” still images can thus reveal not only emotions between the characters, but also between the characters and the editors/viewers.

#### Fourth Layer: All Is Revealed

In similar cases, editors include even more layers of movements, especially in videos more akin to meta-fandom, such as Yandere Day’s “Thrift Shop.” Their video<sup>16</sup> stars the Straw Hats as celebrities. In addition to the usual anime footage, fan art, and *dōjinshi*, we find in this colorful iteration of the Zoro and Sanji fan pairing direct references to other fan mediums: figurines, screenshots of fanfiction, fan art platforms (such as DeviantArt), and celebratory forum discussions. Indeed, the “fans” pictured in the video use texts and tweets to communicate the news amongst themselves. Furthermore, shots from other anime series stands in for the “fan,” allowing the viewer a way into the new narrative. As a girl sits on a sofa, the mention “I ship them” appears in the lower left corner of the screen. Through these means, Yandere taps right into the identity of “*yaoi* fangirls,” most particularly those that are interested (sometimes to the point of becoming obsessed) in both of the characters, whether as individuals or as a couple. This type of self-reflexive remediation can be considered as another technique used to integrate the emotions normally found in *shōjo* narratives. In this case, the lyrics heard in “Thrift Shop” don’t refer to the hidden feelings Zoro and Sanji feel for each other, but rather those they have for their “fans.” In a sort of “meta combination,” the emotions felt by the fans are added to models previously demonstrated (stillness and movements) through the inclusion of these additional excerpts. We now have three layers of emotion—the characters’, the video editor’s, and the fans’—floating amongst a multitude of movements. The protagonists’ blur the traditional delimitations of gender within the narrative and, in addition, fans of any gender are invited to identify with, desire, and/or celebrate said protagonists.

#### Conclusion

In conclusion, Naoko Mori’s framework suggests that *yaoi dōjinshi* represents the sum of two styles of expression: *shōnen*’s moving bodies and *shōjo*’s emotional stillness. Through this combination, *yaoi* is able to provide for fans an alternative to normative heterosexuality through the act of remixing and reinterpreting traditional masculinity, simultaneously identifying with and desiring the transformed male body. As I demonstrated, this framework not only applies to animated media, but is reinforced by the nature of Anime Music Videos and *Dōjinshi* Music Videos; the various techniques of remediation employed by AMV and DMV editors multiply the possible strategies to blur these divides, which I hope contributes to opening a space to approach alternate gender representations.

#### Notes

1. Vidding is a form of fan videos using mostly clips of live action television series and movies remixed to the rhythm of one or more chosen song(s).
2. “Ship” is short for “relationship”.
3. My use of “woman” and “female” in this paper includes all individuals who identify as women.
4. As the analyzed videos are present in the English-language fandom, I will focus mainly on Western models of masculinity. However, some points might also apply to Japanese models of masculinity.
5. In the Western context, *yaoi* often depicts sexual relationships between male characters without developing a narrative beyond that of events that directly lead to the consumption of said relationship. In Western online communities, Hardcore BL and *yaoi* are often used interchangeably.
6. Translated into English as the “Magnificent 24s” (Toku 2007, 26) or “Year Twenty-Four Group” (Norris 2009, 244).
7. Manga artist.
8. The first ones known starred the main characters of the series *Captain Tsubasa* (Ōtsuka 2010, 110).
9. The genre also expanded in Japan and increasingly included social issues among its storylines (Bollman 2010, 44).

10. Beautiful boy.
11. An allusion to Luffy's emblematic headwear.
12. This pairing is can also be written as "Zoro + Sanji" or "Zoro x Sanji."
13. In *The Anime Machine* (2009), Thomas Lamarre argued that limited animation should not only be considered in terms of an "absence of movement" (185), but rather as producing movement in a different way due to what happens in the animetic interval (the space between each frame of animation [18]). Once flattened, the numerous layers that make limited animation transform into "potentiality" (192); it is thus important to look at movement in depth (through the layers of a same image) and not just across images played one after the other (in a clip, for example).
14. Although the original Japanese word translates as companion, it signifies more of a friend or family-type of relationship for Luffy.
15. Episode 377, "*Nakama no Itami wa Waga Itami – Zoro Kesshi no Tatakai*"
16. This video was made as an audition piece to enter the AMV collaborative Fairy Piece Studios.

### Filmography

- AMVmultiE. 2016. "[ZoSan] One More Night." Uploaded January 16, 2016. YouTube video, 2:33. <https://youtu.be/rheMX-nQ6D0>.
- Densetsui. "Afterward' // ZoSan." Uploaded February 20, 2017. YouTube video, 0:48. <https://youtu.be/R2-hTxwiRcY>.
- Densetsui. "ZoSan} Beating Heart Baby ❤️." Uploaded April 30, 2011. YouTube video, 2:04. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VII7MOrde8o>.
- Katerina RORONOA. "One Piece – Zoro x Sanji (zosan)." Uploaded December 02, 2011. YouTube video, 2:09. <https://youtu.be/KBshJHUMB0I>.
- Lola Ferreyra. "One Piece Love Me like You Do ZoSan Amv." Uploaded April 08, 2017. YouTube video, 2:52. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4YWlOIhCvt4>.
- Sherlock Elric. "Savin Me With – Zoro X Sanji / Zosan { AMV }." Uploaded February 18, 2019. YouTube video, 0:32. <https://youtu.be/d74F5NNfFWg>.
- Yasuhiko, Yoshikazu, dir. 1987. *Kaze No Ki No Uta, Sanctus*. Based on *Kaze No Ki No Uta*, by Keiko Takemiya, *Shojo Comic*, 1976-1984. Japan: Shogakukan Productions, 1987. Uploaded by robynsegg, January 24, 2012. YouTube video, 59.27. <https://youtu.be/ruV2xh4epQU>.
- Vampiraker. "{ ZoSan ▶ L σ ν ∈ (k̄ī①①ēr̄)}." Uploaded November 01, 2012. YouTube video, 1:05. <https://youtu.be/7ZfGse5THD4>.
- Vampiraker. "{ Zosan ▶ All This Time }." Uploaded December 06, 2013. YouTube Video, 2:32. [https://youtu.be/S26i66gh\\_ds](https://youtu.be/S26i66gh_ds).
- Vampiraker. "{ ZoSan -- м о и с т е я }." Uploaded October 23, 2012. YouTube video, 1:25. <https://youtu.be/-jA8uipd6X8>.
- Vampiraker. { ZoSan ▶ #SELFIE }. Uploaded April 17, 2014. YouTube Video, 1:06. <https://youtu.be/X4dRl-HGoeg>.

### References

- Birmingham, Elizabeth. 2013. "Bringing Smexy Back: Fangirl Production, AMVs, and Transgressive Sexuality." *The Phoenix Papers* 1, no. 1 (April): 146–74.
- Bollmann, Tuuli. 2010. "He-Romance for Her – Yaoi, BL and Shounen-ai." In *Imaginary Japan: Japanese Fantasy in Contemporary Popular Culture*, edited by Eija Niskanen. Turku, Finland: Institute of Popular Culture. <http://iipc.utu.fi/imaginaryjapan/>.
- Close, Samantha. 2014. "Popular Culture Through the Eyes, Ears and Fingertips of Fans: Vidders, Anime Music Video Editors, and Their Sources." In *Sampling Media*, edited by David Laderman and Laurel Westrup, 199–211. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Coppa, Francesca. 2008. "Women, 'Star Trek', and the Early Development of Fannish Vidding." *Transformative Works and Cultures* no. 1. doi:10.3983/twc.2008.0044.
- Coppa, Francesca. (2011). An Editing Room of One's Own: Vidding as Women's Work. *Camera Obscura: Feminism, Culture, and Media Studies*. 26. 123-130.
- Coppa, Francesca, Alexis Lothian, and Tisha Turk. 2018. "Vidding and Identity: A Conversation." In *The Routledge Companion to Media Fandom.*, edited by Melissa A. Click and Suzanne Scott, 230–240. New York: Routledge.
- Ernest dit Alban, Edmond "Edo". 2020. "Sexy Stillness: Towards a Queered Approach to Images' Movement In, On, and Between Japanese Popular Media (and Probably Beyond?)" *Synoptique* 9, no. 1 (April): PAGE NUMBERS.
- Isola, Mark John. 2008. "Yaoi and Slash Fiction: Women Writing, Reading, and Getting Off?" In *Boys' Love Manga: Essays on the Sexual Ambiguity and Cross-Cultural Fandom of the Genre*, edited by Antonia Levi, Mark McHarry, and Dru Pagliassotti, 84–98. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company.
- Ishida, Minori. 2008. *Hisoyakanakyôiku, BL yaoizenshi*. Tokyo: Rakuhokun.
- Freund, Katharina M. 2013. "'We're Making Our Own Happy Ending!': The Doctor Who Fan Vidding Community." In *Fan Phenomena: Doctor Who*, edited by Paul Booth, 96–105. Bristol: Intellect.
- Freund, Katharina M., "Veni, Vidi, Vids!" audiences, gender and community in Fan Vidding, Doctor of Philosophy thesis, School of Social Sciences, Media and Communications, Faculty of Arts, University of Wollongong, 2011.
- Jenkins, Henry. 2006. *Fans, Bloggers, and Gamers Exploring Participatory Culture*. New York: New York University Press.
- Jenkins, Henry. 2013. *Textual Poachers: Television Fans and Participatory Culture*. New York: Routledge.
- Lamarre, Thomas. *The Anime Machine: A Media Theory of Animation*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2009.
- McHarry, Mark. "Identity Unmoored: Yaoi in the West." In *The Cambridge Companion to Modern Japanese Culture*, edited by Yoshio Sugimoto, 185–198. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Meyer, Uli. 2010. "Hidden in Straight Sight: Trans\*Gressing Gender and Sexuality via BL." In *Boys' Love Manga: Essays on the Sexual Ambiguity and Cross-Cultural Fandom of the Genre*, edited by Antonia Levi, Mark McHarry, and Dru Pagliassotti, 232–263. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company.
- Mori, Naoko. 2010. *Onna wa poruno o yomu: Josei no seiyoku to feminizumu*. Tokyo: Seikyusha.
- Mori, Naoko. 2012. "Manga hyôgen no shiten kara mita yaoi." *Eureka* 44 (15): 88-94.
- Roberts, Ian. 2012. "Genesis of the Digital Anime Music Video Scene, 1990–2001." *Transformative Works and Cultures* 9. <https://doi.org/10.3983/twc.2012.0365>.
- Swatman, Rachel. 2015. "Japanese Manga One Piece Sets Record for Most Printed Comic Series by One Author Ever." *Guinness World Records*. June 26, 2015. <https://www.guinnessworldrecords.com/news/2015/6/japanese-manga-one-piece-is-most-printed-comic-series-by-one-author-ever-385868>.
- Toku, Masami. 2007. "Shojo Manga! Girls Comics! A Mirror of Girls Dreams." *Mechademia* 2: 19–32. <https://doi.org/10.1353/mec.0.0013>.
- Turk, Tisha and Joshua Johnson. 2012. "Toward an Ecology of Vidding." In "Fan/Remix Video," edited by Francesca Coppa and Julie Levin Russo, special issue, *Transformative Works and Cultures*, no. 9. <https://doi.org/10.3983/twc.2012.0326>.
- Ueno Chizuko. 1998. *Hatsujô Souchi: Erosu no Shinario*. Tokyo: Chikuma Shobou.
- Welker, James. 2006. "Beautiful, Borrowed, and Bent: 'Boys' Love' as Girls' Love in *Shôjo Manga*." *Signs* 31, no. 3 (Spring): 841–870.
- Wood, Andrea. 2006. "'Straight' Women, Queer Texts: Boy-Love Manga and the Rise of a Global Counterpublic." *Women's Studies Quarterly* 34, no. 1/2 (Spring–Summer): 394–414.